



# ERETZ HEMDAH ASK THE RABBI SERVICE

RAV DANIEL MANN



לעולי נשמה  
יואל אפרים בן אברהם עוזיאל זלצמן ז"ל

## Possibly Early *Mincha*

**Question:** I (a woman) noticed after finishing *Mincha* that it was two minutes after the earliest time to *daven Mincha*, so I must have started *Shemoneh Esrei* (=SE) before the time. Should I repeat SE?

**Answer:** Earliest *Mincha* time on our halachic calendars is a half hour after *chatzot* (astronomical midday). Since the three *tefillot* relate to morning, afternoon, and night, we would have expected *Mincha* to begin at *chatzot*. The reason it does not is critical to answering your question.

One *gemara* (Yoma 28b) reports that Avraham *davened Mincha* right after *chatzot* and wonders why in the *Beit Hamikdash* they never slaughtered the afternoon *korban* until a half hour later. One of the *gemara*'s answers is that Avraham was an expert in knowing when it

was *chatzot*, whereas others wait a half hour to make sure it is afternoon. The Magen Avraham (233:1) learns from here that fundamentally the earliest time for *Mincha* is *chatzot*, and our practice of waiting a half hour is precautionary.

Another *gemara* (Berachot 26b) writes categorically that the earliest first starting time of *Mincha* (*Mincha Gedola*) is 6.5 hours (i.e., half an hour after *chatzot*), which corresponds to the earliest afternoon *korban* of the year (*Mincha Ketana* is at 9.5 hours into the day, the usual time of the *korban*). One reconciliation of the *gemarot* is that *Yoma* follows the approach that the *tefillot* were modeled after the patriarch's *tefillot* and that *Berachot* follows the approach that they are modeled after the *korbanot*, i.e., never before 6.5 hours (Magen Gibborim 233:1).

Conceptually, the Magen Avraham (*ibid.*) saw the extra half hour as a precaution, according to which we would expect that if one accidentally *davened* during the half hour he would be *yotzei*. Yet, he infers from the Shulchan Aruch (Orach Chayim 233:1) that since he views *Mincha Gedola* itself as *b'di'eved*, before 6.5 hours must be totally invalid. The *Pri Megadim* (*ad loc.*) counters that there could be three levels: optimal- *Mincha Ketana*; less than optimal- *Mincha Gedola*; *b'di'eved*- during the half hour.

The Mishna Berura (233:2) suggests that if we wait a half hour due to concern for mistake, we should treat someone who *davened* then like one who is unsure if he *davened* properly, who does not need, according to the basic law, to *daven* again (see *Be'ur Halacha* 107:1). However, he also raises the following reason not to be *yotzei b'di'eved*. Irrespective of the original

**NACHI REALTY 054-461-3943**

**In a finished, brand new building on  
Mekor Chaim Street** - Spacious 2, 3 & 4 rooms  
apartments, Sukka mirpesets, storage, parking  
and Shabbat elevator, 2 rooms - 2.17m NIS;  
large 86m 3 room - 3.17m NIS and 4 rooms -  
3.79m NIS

**Great opportunity to buy in a new building  
under construction in Arnona/Talpiot** -  
2-5 rooms, great payment terms and prices  
start at just 2.39m NIS

Eretz Hemdah, the Institute for Advanced Jewish Studies, Jerusalem, is headed by Rav Yosef Carmel and Rav Moshe Ehrenreich, founded by Rav Shaul Yisraeli, zt"l, to prepare rabbanim and dayanim to serve the National Religious community in Israel and abroad. Ask the Rabbi is a joint venture of the OU, Eretz Hemdah, and OU Israel's Torah Tidbits.



reason for adding the half hour, once it was set, prior to that time is simply and fully the wrong time (Sha'ar Hatziyun 233:6). This approach finds expression in the opinion that during this half hour, one can even *daven Shacharit* (see Mishna Berura 89:7). The Mishna Berura does not resolve the question whether one who *davened Mincha* during the half hour must repeat *Mincha*. (If one chose to do so, she **might** make a condition that if she was already *yotzeit*, the second *tefilla* is a *nedava* (see opinions in Ishei Yisrael 27:(9).)

We now turn to your case's specific details. The fact that you **ended SE** at the right time does not help. Although a minority opinion holds that if one starts *SE* at the right time, he is *yotzei* even if he finishes after the end point, that is because the beginning may have special importance (see Aruch Hashulchan, OC 110:5). The end does not have such importance!

What is helpful is that your case occurred in early winter. It is not clear whether the half hour is a *sha'ah zemanit* or 30 minutes on the clock (see Sha'ar Hatziyun 233:8), and most calendars are *machmir* in both directions. Therefore, you started before the end of the

30 minutes, but after half of a winter *sha'ah zemanit*. Your being a woman might call for slight leniency. Women are obligated in *tefilla*, but **some** say that once a day suffices (see Mishna Berura 106:4). Even if you *daven Mincha* regularly, this doubt can be added to the others.

Most *poskim* rule that one who *davened Mincha* during the half hour after *chatzot* was *yotzei* (see Ishei Yisrael 27:5; Tefilla K'hilchata 3:39). This is clearer in your case due to the additional indications. ■

## Having a dispute?



For a Din Torah in English or Hebrew contact:

Eretz Hemdah—Gazit  
Rabbinical Court

077-215-8-215 • Fax: (02) 537-9626  
[beitdin@eretzhemdah.org](mailto:beitdin@eretzhemdah.org)

Wills • Probate • Pre & Post-Nuptial Agreements  
Guardianship • Durable Power of Attorney  
(Financial/Health/Personal Decisions)

**HALACHIC ESTATE PLANNING**  
**TIRTZA JOTKOWITZ, ESQ.**

[tirtzaj@gmail.com](mailto:tirtzaj@gmail.com) • 052-509-3356 • 02-625-6475  
(845) 425-8871 • (845) 694-7645



The Long  
Short Road

## THE LONG SHORT ROAD WARMLINE

A first-of-its-kind peer support service in the Jewish community

We hold  
space.

We listen  
deeply.

We help people feel less alone in  
the moments that matter most.

**A SAFE, CONFIDENTIAL, JUDGMENT-FREE PLACE  
TO TALK, CONNECT, AND BE TRULY HEARD.**

Warmline Hours:

Sunday–Thursday:  
10:00 am–10:00pm

Friday (Winter):  
10:00am–3:00pm

**CALL:  
484 474 0544**

Because no  
one should  
struggle  
alone.

Friday (Summer):  
10:00am–6:00pm

[www.thelongshortroad.org](http://www.thelongshortroad.org)