



Lighting Candles When Staying at Another's House

Question: I am traveling to the US on Chanuka; my wife will be staying home. When I will be staying with family and/or friends, can/should I light there regularly?

Answer: The *gemara* (Shabbat 23a) states that an *achsenai* (guest) is obligated in Chanuka lighting. It then tells of Rav Zeira as a guest, who as a single man, would pay a small sum toward the homeowner's oil/lighting to be included in his lighting, and as a married man would fulfill the *mitzva* with his wife's lighting at home. This ostensibly gives you two valid options – 1. Fulfill your *mitzva* with your wife's lighting in your house; 2. Give money to your host so that his lighting counts for you. We add the option you suggest: 3. Light yourself at your host's house. We will investigate each

before summarizing.

Wife lighting – The Shulchan Aruch (Orach Chayim 677:1) confirms that a traveler can fulfill the *mitzva* with his wife's lighting, but does not say if this is best. The Terumat Hadeshen (I:101) recommended, based on the idea of *mehadrin*, i.e., it is proper that everyone lights their own candles, that the traveling husband also lights where he is with a *beracha*. The Maharshal (Shut 85) says that if one knows his wife is lighting at home and he thereby fulfills his *mitzva*, he cannot choose to light with a *beracha*. Although we allow, based on *mehadrin*, the children of the house to light after their father already lit, which can fulfill their *mitzva*, many posit that *mehadrin* does not apply to a husband and

WE WISH EVERYONE CHAG CHANUKAH – SOMAYACH-SIMCHA-SHALOM-TOVIM-BROCHA-ALWAYS

<p>NEVE SHAMIR –NEW PROJECTS</p>  <p>HIGH DEMAND 3,4,5 ROOMS GARDENS AND PENTHOUSES LIMITED TO 3 PER PERSON FROM 1,950,000 NIS</p>	<p>NETANYA –PRE SALE</p>  <p>NETANYA STUNNING 4,5 ROOMS CLOSE TO IR YAMIM ALL WITH SUKKAH BALCONIES FROM 2.3 MILLION NIS</p>	<p>HADERA – PRE SALE</p>  <p>4 ROOMS 98 M2 WITH 14 M2 BALCONIES NIS LIMITED OFFER NO MADAD 5 MINUTE DRIVE TO BEACH FROM 1,790,000 NIS</p>	
<p>TIBERIAS – PRE SALE</p>  <p>LAKE VIEWS OPTION TO HAVE PRIVATE POOL 3 ROOMS 4 ROOMS GARDENS AND PENTHOUSES FROM 1,800,000 NIS</p>	<p>R'ANANA – PRE SALE</p>  <p>NEW HIGH LEVEL PROJECT – SPACIOUS UNITS CLOSE TO ALL AMENITIES NEIGHBORHOOD VARIOUSE OPTIONS CONTACT US TODAY</p>	<p>NEVE SHAMIR NEW PROJECT</p>  <p>HIGH DEMAND CLOSE TO ALEPH AND MISHKAFAYIM 3,4,5 ROOMS HIGH LEVEL FINISHES HURRY CONTACT US TODAY FROM 2,180,000 NIS</p>	 <p>ISRAEL PROPERTIES BY STAMELMAN & PARTNERS</p>

Toviyah +972 50 446 9515, Daniel +972 53 444 0928 , Lara +972 58 661 1968, Yehudah +972 52 564 0130, Debbie +972 58 322 9858

www.israel-properties.com | Tel/WhatsApp IL +972 50 446 9515 | Office +972 2 568 6578 | toviyah@israel-properties.com

a wife, because they form a more cohesive unit (Eliya Rabba 671:3). On the other hand, some say that this cohesiveness is only when they are together (see Terumat Hadeshen *ibid.*; Am Mordechai, Mo'ed 24).

A major factor, which was once rare and not discussed by early *poskim*, is the matter of time zones. When your wife lights, it will be the previous daytime for you, when you are not obligated in lighting. When your obligation comes along, can you say that you already fulfilled the *mitzva*, before the *mitzva* applied where you were, because it was the right time for your house (and for your wife)? In Living the Halachic Process VI, D-8, we referred to a major *machloket* on the matter, and leaned toward the opinion that it does not work (see Minchat Yitzchak VII:46).

Contributing toward the hosts – The aforementioned *gemara* and Shulchan Aruch confirm that this works when he joins up with the household of the home in which he is presently staying. Most say that the money is to acquire a part in the oil that will be lit, and therefore if he is given permission to lift it up (a *kinyan*) and acquire some, it suffices without paying (Mishna Berura 677:3).

Lighting yourself: There are opinions that it is better if the guest lights on his own than to rely on his part with the homeowner (*ibid.*). In Sha'ar Hatziyun (ad loc. 10), he explains that it is in deference to the opinion that, given that nowadays everyone lights, if the guest does not light separately,

it looks as if he is not taking part in the lighting. However, it is far from clear that such a technical rationale for a separate lighting would justify a *beracha*. It is true that when all the members of the household light, all make a *beracha* even though they could be *yotzei* with the head of the household, but this might be because they have *kavana* not to be *yotzei* with those who lit before them (Shut R. Akiva Eiger II:13). While you could do this also, having in mind not to be *yotzei* would be risky. Not all agree that you can fulfill the *mitzva* yourself since you are not a member of the household (see Am Mordechai *ibid.* in the name of Rav Soloveitchik).

Recommendation: Give the *peruta* to your hosts and have in mind to be *yotzei* with the lighting and *berachot* done there. Light again, using the *berachot* to which you answered *amen* as the *berachot* for your lighting (without speaking between the *berachot* and your lighting), in case such a lighting is a worthwhile additional act of Chanuka lighting (see Mishna Berura 677:16). ■

Having a dispute?



For a Din Torah in English or Hebrew contact 'Eretz Hemdah - Gazit' Rabbinical Court: 077-215-8-215 • fax: (02) 537-9626
beitdin@eretzhemdah.org