



Mistakes in *Kiddush* of *Yom Tov* that Falls on Shabbat

Question: I sometimes get confused in the *Kiddush* of *Yom Tov* that falls on Shabbat. What does one do if he did not say all of the correct elements?

Answer: There are too many permutations to touch all of them, but we will try to address the main ones, with a focus on likely mistakes. Most of the relevant sources discuss the similar combinations in *davening*, but for the most part, the applications in both cases are the same (Mishna Berura 287:2).

If one totally left out either Shabbat (e.g., by missing all the words in parentheses in the *siddur/bentcher*) or *Yom Tov* (e.g., by opening up to *Kiddush* of Shabbat), one is not *yotzei* (Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata 47:41). The question is if he mentioned each at some but not all points. It is necessary to relate to the correct day(s) in the main body of the *beracha*, and if he left it out, it is not enough if he recited the right thing in the *beracha's* ending (see Shulchan

Aruch, Orach Chayim 487:3).

If one says "... *vatiten lanu ... et yom haShabbat hazeh*," that is enough even if he forgot the other mentions (and obviously if he left out "*b'ahava*"). It is less clear if he mentioned Shabbat only in the last words before the end *beracha*, as that might be considered part of the end and not the main body of the *beracha* (see Mishna Berura 487:13). Regarding the *Yom Tov* element, "... *vatiten lanu ... et yom...*" is even more important, as one must mention the specific holiday (Mishna Berura 487:11; Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata 47:42), and it is mentioned only once during *Kiddush*.

The end of the *beracha* is very important, and if one recites on a regular *Yom Tov* the ending of Shabbat or vice versa, he is not *yotzei* (see Shulchan Aruch, OC 487:1). The matter is less clear on *Yom Tov* that falls on Shabbat. If he leaves out one element, the *beracha* could still be significant because he correctly addressed one element. While the missing element is crucial, perhaps it is enough that it was mentioned in the midst of the *beracha*. The Knesset Hagedola (to Tur, OC 487) says that if one mentioned Shabbat in the middle but not at the end on Shabbat/*Yom Tov*, he does not need to repeat *Shemoneh Esrei*. The Pri Chadash (OC 487:1) presumes that the Knesset Hagedola's basis is the *halacha* (Shulchan Aruch, OC 268:4) that if one *davened* a weekday *Shemoneh Esrei*

The Orthodox Union - via its website - fields questions of all types in areas of kashrut, Jewish law and values. Some of them are answered by Eretz Hemdah, the Institute for Advanced Jewish Studies, Jerusalem, headed by Rav Yosef Carmel and Rav Moshe Ehrenreich, founded by HaRav Shaul Yisraeli zt"l, to prepare rabbanim and dayanim to serve the National Religious community in Israel and abroad. Ask the Rabbi is a joint venture of the OU, Yerushalayim Network, Eretz Hemdah... and OU Israel's Torah Tidbits.



on Shabbat and mentioned Shabbat in its midst, without a separate Shabbat *beracha*, he is *yotzei*. However, the Pri Chadash rejects the proof based on the fact that on a certain level, a full *Shemoneh Esrei* on Shabbat could have been appropriate, whereas a seven-*beracha amida* on Shabbat and Yom Tov needs to be done with an accurate middle *beracha*. We assume like the Pri Chadash, including in regard to *Kiddush* (Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata ibid. 41). If he did not speak extraneous things, he would not have to repeat Borei Pri Hagafen (HaSeder He'aruch 52:7). If he repeated the *beracha* and the second time mentioned only Shabbat and not *Yom Tov*, he is likely *yotzei* since both elements were ultimately recited (see Igrot Moshe, OC IV, 70:14).

If one mentioned Shabbat at the end and not *Yom Tov*, the situation is better, based on the following source. The *gemara* (Beitza 17a) cites three opinions of *Tannaim* regarding what the proper break-up

of *berachot* is for the *amida* of Shabbat/Yom Tov. Beit Hillel says that the *beracha* ends with mention of only Shabbat, whereas *Yom Tov* is mentioned only in the middle. We *pasken* like Rebbe, who says that the end *beracha* mentions both Shabbat and *Yom Tov*. However, many presume that Rebbe only came to add on *Yom Tov* as a *lechatchila*, whereas if one mentions *Yom Tov* in the middle and ends with only Shabbat, Rebbe agrees that he is *yotzei* (Be'ur Halacha to OC 487:1). The Be'ur Halacha points out that the Yerushalmi's version of Rebbe is like Beit Hillel (the end *beracha* need not mention *Yom Tov*), and the discrepancy is more palatable if Rebbe agrees *b'di'eved*. Thus, regarding practical halacha, mention of the specific *Yom Tov* in the midst of the *beracha* is sufficient *b'di'eved* (Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata ibid.). ■

FOR SALE

New on the market - Huge luxury apartment in Old Katamon. 211m, one level, 2nd floor, 5 bedrooms, 4 bathrooms (2 ensuite), 3 balconies (2 sukkahs), 4 exposures, stunning view, facing the park, 2 covered parking spaces, large storage room.

For details, please contact

Chavi 054-345-6713 | Batsheva 054-397-3464
Eli 054-397-8899

Having a dispute?



For a Din Torah in English or Hebrew contact 'Eretz Hemdah - Gazit' Rabbinical Court: 077-215-8-215 • fax: (02) 537-9626
beitdin@eretzhemdah.org

Jonathan Rosenblum, DPM

050-595-5161

Pediatric and Geriatric Foot Care, Bunions, Hammertoes, and Diabetic Wound Care